Plagiarism exercise

Look at the original text in the boxes¹, and then the samples based on the original. Discuss whether the students’ writing samples are paraphrases or summaries, or some form of plagiarism. If so, what kind of plagiarism is it, and how serious is it? What would you do to the student? How could the problems be fixed?

1. Example #1a – excerpt from original journal article

In South Korea, the site of our research project, there is a conscious effort to provide equal educational opportunities for secondary school children (Seth, 2002). Students who reside in a specific local education district are allocated to a school within the district through a lottery system, and teachers, vice-principals, and principals in state schools are rotated within their provincial or metropolitan (not just local) education district, usually every four years.

Example #1b – student writing sample

In South Korea, there is a conscious effort to provide equal educational opportunities for secondary school children. Students in each district are assigned to a school in the district through a lottery system; teachers, principles and vice-principals in state schools are rotated among schools throughout the entire metropolitan area, usually every four years.

Example #1c – second student writing sample

In South Korea, students are randomly assigned to a school in their district, and teachers are regularly rotated among schools throughout the metropolitan area (Guilloteaux & Dörnyei, 2008).

¹ The contents of this exercise are based on the following article:
2. Example #2a – original

...However, these studies relied solely on teachers’ self-reports about how important they considered certain strategies and how often they used them; they were not based on documentation of the actual nature of the participating teachers’ motivational practice—which would have been more objective—nor on any classroom student behavior to which such practice might have been linked.

The current research aims to fill this gap by providing empirical data obtained in a large-scale investigation of 40 ESOL classrooms in South Korea, which involved more than 1,300 learners and examined the link between the teachers’ motivational teaching practice and their students’ language learning motivation. A novel feature of our study is that, in contrast to the usual practice of L2 motivation research, which relies on self-report questionnaires, our research paradigm includes a salient classroom observation component. For this purpose, we developed a new classroom observation instrument, ...

In the current study, we set out to examine empirically how a teacher’s motivational teaching practice affects his or her students’ motivated learning behavior, as manifested by the amount of attention the students pay in class and the extent of their participation and volunteering in tasks. When we designed the study, we realized that the standard data gathering technique of L2 motivation research—namely, the administration of questionnaires—would not be sufficient to assess this process. We therefore decided to carry out a large-scale classroom observation study with a motivational focus, with the intention of producing generalizable results and of obtaining varied and rich quantitative data concerning both the teacher and the students. To this effect, we designed a highly structured observation scheme following the model of Spada and Fröhlich’s (1995) COLT. We supplemented this instrument with a student questionnaire and a teacher appraisal form.

At the beginning of the study, we faced an important decision: Should we visit each site more than once, or should we increase the sample size to the level that is appropriate to produce statistically significant results? The former option would have enhanced the picture we obtained of each class but would have reduced the number of L2 classes that we could include in our sample. Therefore, partly because we wanted to combine the observational data with a student survey, we chose the second option and included 40 learner groups in our study, with a student population of more than 1,300. It followed from such a design that, instead of focusing on the impact of specific strategies used by specific teachers, which would have required a more intensive and preferably longitudinal investigation, we focused on examining the quality of the teachers’ overall motivational teaching practice by generating a composite index of the rich observational data.

Example #2b – student writing

Finding past motivation studies based solely on questionnaire data inadequate, Guilloteaux and Dörnyei (2008) used a hybrid observational and survey study paradigm. They observed English classes at a number of secondary schools in Seoul, coded the teacher and student behavior, and administered questionnaires to the students. The authors deliberated between a more specific longitudinal study of a smaller number of subjects, or a more extensive study of a larger number of L2 classes based on one-time observations; they opted for the latter for a larger-scope study. However, there was no reason both approaches could not have been done for a two-part study – a large-scale study like the one reported, and a smaller, more detailed longitudinal study as a follow-up study.
3. Example #3a – original

Motivation is one of the most important concepts in psychology. Theories concerning motivation attempt to explain nothing less than why humans behave and think as they do. The notion is also of great importance in language education. Teachers and students commonly use the term to explain what causes success or failure in learning. Indeed, motivation provides the primary impetus to initiate second or foreign language (L2) learning and later the driving force to sustain the long and often tedious learning process. Without sufficient motivation, individuals with the most remarkable abilities cannot accomplish long-term goals. Similarly, appropriate curricula and good teaching are not enough on their own to ensure student achievement—students also need to have a modicum of motivation (for recent reviews, see Dörnyei, 2005; Ushioda, in press).

Example #3b – student writing

Theories of motivation attempt to explain nothing less than why humans behave and think as they do (Guilloteaux & Dörnyei, 2008). The concept is also of important in language education, since teachers and students commonly use the term to explain what causes success or failure in learning. Motivation provides the primary force for beginning second or foreign language (L2) learning and later the driving force to sustain the long and difficult learning process. Without sufficient motivation, individuals with even the highest abilities cannot accomplish long-term goals. Similarly, appropriate curricula and good teaching are not enough on their own to ensure student achievement—students also need to have a modicum of motivation (for recent reviews, see Dörnyei, 2005; Ushioda, in press).

4. Example #4a – original

A principal component analysis confirmed our prediction because it yielded a one-factor solution (with the first factor having an eigenvalue of 1.8 that was twice as large as the eigenvalue of a possible second factor), which explained 60% of the total variance. Consequently, we used this factor score as the self-reported student motivation index.

Example #4b – student writing

A principal component analysis confirmed their prediction because it yielded a one-factor solution; this single factor score was decided upon as the self-reported student motivation index.

Example #4c – second student writing

The researchers reported the results of a factor analysis of the survey data, and concluded that one underlying factor (a general class motivation factor) was apparent from the survey data. However, they reported an eigenvalue of 1.8 for the first factor, being “twice as large as the eigenvalue of a possible second factor”, but a second factor of c. 0.9 could also be significant.
Traditionally, motivational psychologists have been more concerned about what motivation is than about how we can use this knowledge to motivate learners. Recently, however, more and more researchers have decided to examine the pedagogical implications of research by conceptualizing motivational strategies (for reviews in educational psychology, see, e.g., Brophy, 2004; Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2000; Pintrich & Schunk, 2002; within the area of language education, see, e.g., Alison & Halliwell, 2002; Dörnyei, 2001, 2006; Williams & Burden, 1997). Thus, motivation research has reached a level of maturity such that theoretical advances have started to inform methodological developments. This article has been written in that vein.

As Guilloteaux and Dörnyei (2008) note, past psychologists often studied the characteristics of motivation itself, rather than for application to educational contexts such as motivating students. However, the latter area has begun to receive more attention in recent years, such that theoretical and research findings have been made of the type that also have more direct application for pedagogy. Some have examined its pedagogical implications in terms of motivational strategies (in educational psychology, e.g., Brophy, 2004; Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2000; Pintrich & Schunk, 2002; in language education, e.g., Alison & Halliwell, 2002; Dörnyei, 2001, 2006; Williams & Burden, 1997).

Past researchers have examined the implications of motivational strategies for teaching in educational psychology (see Guilloteaux and Dörnyei (2008) for references).

Past researchers have examined the implications of motivational strategies for teaching in educational psychology (e.g., Brophy (2004) and others, as cited in Guilloteaux and Dörnyei (2008)).

**Exercise: Paraphrasing**

Look back at #2a and 2b, and discuss the following.

- How much of the original content appears in the paraphrase?
- What structural (grammatical, lexical) changes occur in the process?
- How does the writer decide what to retain and what to ignore?
- How does the writer then make use of the material?
- How does the writer distinguish the information from the source from his/her own ideas?
Paraphrasing techniques

The following are methods typically used by skilled writers in paraphrasing and summarizing information cited in their academic papers. Writers generally begin by condensing and restructuring sentences and phrases, and in the process, retaining some information while omitting other information. In the process, they also change content words (nouns, verbs, adjectives) when possible, e.g., by substituting synonyms. As an initial consideration, though, we will also look at verb tenses, as choice of verb tense is a question that novice writers face in academic writing.

1. Selecting and omitting information
When citing and using information from a source for their own academic writings, novice writers may make the mistake of including too much information from the source, including unnecessary details and items that are not relevant to the purpose of the paper. Experienced writers leave out less important information from the source article, such as:

• background information, historical background, or theoretical background that the potential readers would likely know already

• minor details of experimental design and procedures

• statistical results of experiments

• details of the author's line of reasoning in his/her analysis

• any information that is not relevant to the main point of the writer's paper

Instead, the main findings, conclusions, or implications are usually the focus of the summarized / paraphrased information. Based on what is included or omitted, writers then condense and restructure sentences.

2. Verb tenses
Think about the verb tenses used in your field in when using information from sources. For each type of section or genre, what function do cited sources play in the paper, and what verb tenses are used when you paraphrase and use information from sources? Note: the tenses that are more commonly used may vary by field.

1. introductions 7. experimental results
2. historical background 8. discussion sections
3. theoretical discussion 9. literary analysis
4. literature reviews (of past studies & research) 10. qualitative analysis of data
5. research hypotheses or research questions 11. implications / applications
6. experimental design & procedures 12. conclusion / summary
Why are these tenses commonly used in such sections in your field? The main linguistic functions of these forms are explained below. How are these functions relevant to the verb forms used in writing in your field?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>tense</th>
<th>example</th>
<th>function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Simple present</td>
<td>X develops rapidly</td>
<td>general or theoretical statements, assertions, or truths; general beliefs; theoretical claims, or statements within a theoretical context; claims that are generally accepted in a field or theoretical framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X causes Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Present progressive</td>
<td>X is developing</td>
<td>Present trends, on-going events (not so common in academic writing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(continuous)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perfect</td>
<td>Few studies have examined this issue in detail.</td>
<td>Showing current relevance of recent past events (recent, from the writer’s perspective); more vivid descriptions of near past events with current consequences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(present perfect)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple past</td>
<td>The study subjects chose one of the two doors.</td>
<td>Specific points in the past; narratives and historical discussion; past research or discoveries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pluperfect</td>
<td>After they had experimented with engines, they went on to try aerodynamics.</td>
<td>Completion of one action by a certain date, or in the distant past, relative to other past events (more common in writing than in spoken English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(past perfect)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future</td>
<td>We will study this further</td>
<td>Future or expected trends, findings, or events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate future</td>
<td>The government is going to have to enact better regulations</td>
<td>Intentions; expected actions in the near future (more informal; not very common in academic writing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive verbs</td>
<td>The experiment was conducted as follows:</td>
<td>Emphasizes actions or events; de-emphasizes or ignores those performing the actions, i.e., the agent or doer (especially common in scientific writing, where the agent is often not important)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50 subjects were recruited and instructed to...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X was found to cause...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modal verbs</td>
<td>can, may, might, should, must...</td>
<td>Potentiality, possibility, hypothetical situations, uncertainty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

2 ‘Theory’ does not necessarily mean ‘not proven’ or ‘not true,’ especially in academic contexts. In science and other fields, a theory is an explanatory framework, a set of claims or propositions designed to explain something, as opposed to a ‘law’ or ‘rule’, which are simple descriptive statements.
2. Pronouns and reformulation expressions

Consider the following options for completing this paragraph. Which sound better?

In the past, flood impact assessments have focused primarily on the economic losses resulting from a flood. Now, however, emphasis is also being placed on potential environmental benefits.

a. It will result in a more complete picture of the gains of losses from a flood.

b. This will result in a more complete picture of the gains of losses from a flood.

c. This expansion will result in a more complete picture of the gains of losses from a flood.

d. This expansion of focus will result in a more complete picture of the gains of losses from a flood.

e. This expansion in assessment focus will result in a more complete picture of the gains of losses from a flood.

f. This expansion in assessment with regard to flooding will result in a more complete picture of the gains of losses from a flood.

What are possible ways of completing these items?

1. Haigney concludes from his study that driving performance decreases when drivers use their cell phones. _______ is consistent with recent reviews of the literature on driving distractions.

2. Although it seems that the construction of new roads and widening of existing roads should reduce traffic congestion, recent research has shown that these activities actually lead to increases in traffic. ____________ is known as the “induced traffic” effect.

This is often used as a reformulation marker instead of repeating a noun phrase; in such cases, this sounds better in formal English than it – as in this situation / event / condition / fact. One may use this, or this plus a contextually appropriate word (this situation / difficulty / view / finding / process / etc.).

3. Content words

Content words are those that carry the main meaning or content of a sentence – nouns, main verbs, adjectives, and major adverbs. Other, more minor words are known as function words. Often, entire sentences or ideas can be summarized with a few content words. Some content words can be replaced with synonyms or other expressions.

3.1. Synonyms

As much as possible, experienced writers replace content words with synonyms, particularly important nouns and verbs, along with condensing and restructuring sentences. Being able to use synonyms requires a good knowledge of vocabulary, and sometimes, a good thesaurus.

However, many field-specific terms – i.e., nomenclature, jargon, specific terminology, technical
terms, and such – often have no appropriate synonyms and cannot be changed. Also, the use of synonyms varies from field to field. In many science and related fields, the writing style is dense and technical, and it is difficult to use synonyms, so key words may simply be repeated regularly.

3.2. Serial verb phrases
Several sentences can be condensed into one sentence with multiple verb phrases.

They observed English classes at a number of secondary schools in Seoul, coded the teacher and student behavior, and administered questionnaires to the students.

3.3. Passive verbs
Passive verbs put more emphasis on what was done or what happened, and leaves out the agents or doers of the action. Thus, longer descriptions of “X did ...” and “we did ...” and such can be reworded more succinctly as “X was done, and Y was performed.”

English teachers were recruited, their English classes at various schools were observed, teacher and student behaviors were coded, and questionnaires were administered to the students.

3.4. Reporting verbs
Reporting verbs indicate cited information and ideas, e.g. 6:

X suggests / reported / observed / recommends / implied / etc.

3.5. Attributive adjectives
Some information can be reduced to descriptive adjectives and noun phrases.

A standard counterbalanced experimental design was used. [substituting for several sentences describing how the experiment was done]

This recent proposal...

Such economic disparity...

4. Nominalizations [명사화, 名詞化]
Entire phrases, ideas and even sentences can often be reduced to shorter noun phrases or even single nouns, and this is common in technical and academic writing. For example:

a. Obviously the government is concerned about some users’ reactions to its move to impose restrictions on Internet usage.

This version (a) is appropriate for academic writing, and is denser than the more colloquial version in (b):

b. Obviously the government is concerned about how some users will react if it tries to impose restrictions on Internet usage.

Also compare, e.g.:

---

6 For more on the grammatical patterns of such verbs, see the longer reporting verb handout at http://www.bit.ly/kentlee7 > ‘Writing aids’.

7 Attributive adjective [한정적 형용사]: An adjective placed directly before and directly modifying a noun (e.g., ‘a successful experiment’), cf. a predicate adjective [술부 형용사] after a linking verb (‘the experiment was successful’).
The military invented the ARPANET, which allowed people to disseminate information like never before. They applied...; how they applied...; where they applied...; how we directed; the direction that our research took. The military's invention of the ARPANET revolutionized the dissemination of information.

5. Foregrounding and backgrounding

Some material can be summarized more briefly, and also phrased in certain grammatical structures to de-emphasize it (backgrounding), so that it leads up to the more important content; the more important information can be put in a main clause for more emphasis (foregrounding). Subordinate clauses are particularly useful for backgrounding less critical information to connect with and lead up to important information in the main clause.

5.1. Prepositional phrases

For the sake of equity and fairness in educational opportunities, students are randomly assigned to a school in their district, and teachers are regularly rotated among schools throughout the metropolitan area.

5.2. Participle phrases

Finding past motivation studies based solely on questionnaire data inadequate, Guilloteaux and Dörnyei (2008) used a hybrid observational and survey study paradigm.

5.3. Infinitive and gerund phrases

To provide equal educational opportunities, ... Implementing a rotation system was found to be effective... 

5.4. Subordinate clauses

Although they decided upon a one-factor solution based on the PCA results, the second eigenvalue may be too close to significance to dismiss right away.

Since they found past studies based solely on questionnaire data inadequate, Guilloteaux and Dörnyei (2008) decided on a hybrid observational and survey study paradigm.

6. Transitionals

As in 3.4 above, transitional or connective\(^8\) words not only facilitate logical flow and connections among ideas, phrases, and clauses, but they also can help to manage the information being cited.

---

\(^8\) These may be called transitionals, transition words, connectors, connectives, etc., and are used to connect words, clauses, ideas, and sentences. For lists and handouts on transitionals, see my website, and look under ‘Writing aids’: http://www.bit.ly/kentlee7.
Some have claimed that theory Y offers a better explanation than theory X. For example, Smith (2008) found that... Further evidence is offered by Jones (2009), who observed that... In fact, most recent studies have provided stronger evidence for Y.

Since they found past studies based solely on questionnaire data inadequate, ...

Sometimes it is necessary to critique, criticize, or take issue with others’ claims or findings. Contrastive connectives like however, although, whereas and others can help to frame such information and distinguish between the cited information and your own critique.

Although they decided upon a one-factor solution based on the PCA results, the second eigenvalue may be too close to significance to dismiss right away.

The researchers reported the results of a factor analysis of the survey data, and concluded that one underlying factor (a general class motivation factor) was apparent from the survey data. However, their reported eigenvalue of 1.8 for the first factor was twice the value for a possible second factor – yet a second factor of c. 0.9 might also be significant.

7. Citation systems

In using sources, we cite the source in the body of the paper itself, the so-called in-text (or inline) citation, as in this example in the APA citation system, which is used in the social sciences.

To this effect, we designed a highly structured observation scheme following the model of Spada and Fröhlich's (1995) COLT.

In the humanities, the MLA or Chicago systems are often used, which also have author and year in parentheses. In some science and engineering fields, in-text numbering systems like IEEE or CBE are used, which look more like this, or with the numbers in superscript, which correspond to the numbered references at the end of the paper.

These radiation effects pose serious problems for warp drive propulsion (1). Similarly, Odie et al. (2) report a detailed experiment that tested the assumption that ...

The large-scale use of dilithium crystals as a warp-drive fuel source is still problematic due to production issues[1][2]. Specifically, Scott[3] reports molecular disintegration in the pre-production process …

For longer discussion of a source, we often cite it at first, followed by several phrases or sentences of continuous discussion of the same source(s), until a transitional word signals (e.g., thus, that is, as a result, or many others) a shift to the writer’s own comments or critique, or to discussion of another source.

A recent study by Smith (2008) confirms the validity of this approach. This study was conducted … [blab blab blab] …. Another study by Jones (2009) replicated the Smith study with an enhanced experimental design to further confirm this effect. The Jones study … [blab blab blab] …. More recently, Fink (2010) and Stein (2010) conducted a similar experiment with … [blab blab blab] …. Thus, the preponderance of the evidence confirms the X approach, and disconfirms theory Y.

Finally, the end of the paper contains a so-called references or works cited section ('works cited' is more common in the humanities) listing full bibliographic information for the works cited. Information on how to use these systems can be found on the web sites of the professional organizations that developed them, or on other websites with academic writing aids, which can be found from a Google search.

9 For APA and MLA, a good place to start is the Purdue English Online Writers’ Lab: owl.english.purdue.edu. See also my website, http://www.bit.ly/kentlee7/writing.htm (see the section on source use).